# Report of the Expert Group on Melamine Incident

# Submitted to the Chief Secretary for Administration (20 October 2008)

### **Introduction**

In September 2008, in the wake of the discovery of melamine in infant formula produced in the Mainland and that there were infants and children in the Mainland who suffered from Kidney stones and kidney failure after consuming these melamine contaminated milk and dairy products, Food and Health Bureau (FHB) took immediate action to address local public concerns on food safety, the health impact on infant/children who might have consumed such contaminated milk and dairy products; and the setting up of dedicated public health services for health screening for children at or under 12 years of age.

# **Setting up of Expert Group on Melamine Incident**

- 2. An Expert Group on Melamine Incident (the Group) chaired by the Secretary for Food and Health was set up on 26 September 2008 to ensure the protection of the health of our citizens. The Group's Terms of Reference is in Annex A. The Group comprises members from both the public and private sectors: academics, medical, public health, food safety and communication experts, and representatives of a number of Government Bureaux and Departments. The Group's membership The Group has also formed three Sub-groups to list is in **Annex B**. look into different issues: namely the Health Services Sub-group, the Treatment Sub-group and the Food Safety, Supply and Control The Terms of Reference and the membership of these Sub-group. three Sub-groups are in Annexes C, D and E.
- 3. The Group met twice on 26 September and 20 October 2008 and each Sub-group met once. This report is endorsed by the Group at its meeting on 20 October 2008.

### **Present situation**

- 4. Our public health services have been able to cope with the demand in various aspects. The Hospital Authority's (HA's) 18 Designated Clinics (DCs) and nine Special Assessment Centre (SACs) have been able to meet the demand for screening of Hong Kong children at or under 12 years of age. The attendance rate was high when the screening service first commenced at the end of September but it has now stabilized and is on a decreasing trend. HA has also provided treatment for ten reported cases so far. The surveillance conducted by the Centre for Health Protection (CHP) of the Department of Health (DH) have fully performed their functions of collecting, collating and disseminating daily information on case reports. The Centre's telephone hotline service was in high demand at the beginning and this is now reduced.
- 5. Notwithstanding the novel nature of the melamine tainted milk product (MTMP) disorders, our local clinical experts have been able to gather information from Mainland and local hospitals, and make recommendations on the case definition, diagnosis and clinical treatment of these cases. Further clinical follow-up and research studies are being considered.
- We are mindful of the need to enhance food safety for The Centre for Food Safety (CFS) has intensified its surveillance, sampling and testing of milk and dairy products on a systematic basis, with priorities for infant formula and food for babies. The results are announced and uploaded onto the CFS website the same day for public information. With over 2,500 tests conducted so far, about 1% of the samples were found to contain melamine exceeding the legal limit. All infant formula in the local market have been tested and the results are satisfactory. The testing programme is continuing smoothly with a more targeted approach. After setting legal standards for melamine in food, top priority is given to further legislative amendments to empower the authorities to, when necessary, issue orders to prohibit input and sale, and order recall of problem food.

- 2 -

# **Action Progress and Recommendations of the Expert Group**

#### **Health Services**

- 7. Noting that it is essential to allay public fear through answering the questions they have on their or their children's health; providing free and accessible health screening service in the public sector for eligible Hong Kong children at or under 12; coordinating with the private medical sector to ensure that we have daily assessment of the territory-wide situation and ensuring that the public health screening service is meeting the demand, the Food and Health Bureau receives daily reports on the various services. are: the telephone hotline operated by the CHP of DH and the report of cases from both the public and private medical sectors; the capacity and attendance numbers at HA's 18 DCs and nine SACs; and the cross border movement of people including arrival and departure of children under 11 who are re-entry permit holders at our land and ferry control points. The Group's observations and recommendations are set out below:
  - **CHP**: From the daily number of telephone enquires (a) handled, the height of public concern was at end September. Since the setting up of the hotline on 21 September 2008, which operated daily from 9 am to 5 pm, CHP handled over 1,000 telephone enquiries from 23 to 26 September 2008 per day, peaking on 25 September 2008 which registered 1,876 enquiries. number has decreased substantially since, down to 65 on 18 October 2008. The CHP has handled a total of 9,866 telephone enquiries from 21 September to 18 October The Group endorses that the hotline should continue to operate during office hours on weekdays and Saturday mornings but in view of the reduced demand, it can stand down its service on Saturday afternoon and Sunday.
  - (b) CHP case reports: As of 19 October 2008, CHP

- 3 -

received a total of 10 case reports, of which 2 came from the private medical sector, 4 from HA SACs and 4 from other units of HA. This notification arrangement and daily public announcement of case report should continue until further notice.

- HA DCs and SACs: Since 23 September 2008, HA has (c) set up 18 DCs and nine SACs. On average, the DCs provide 2,000 consultations per day, but on Saturdays, Sundays and school holidays, the demand increases, peaking at 4,160 on Saturday 27 September 2008, decreasing to 3,598 on 1 October 2008 (National holiday) and 976 on Saturday 18 October 2008. The SACs provide on average about 500-600 consultations per day. Although it is not possible to identify how many Hong Kong born children living in the Mainland have come to Hong Kong for the screening service, the attendance rate during the National Day extended holiday suggests that there has not been an unusual surge and the increased demands tie in with local school holidays. extended its operating hours during the National Day extended holiday, with the Department of Health deploying staff to HA. As of 18 October 2008, the DCs have screened 41,748 cases and the SACs assessed 12.394 cases. The DCs and SACs have now reverted to its regular operating hours and the Group agrees that this could continue, while the demand should be closely monitored and the operating hours adjusted if the demand warrants increased service. The daily report and public announcement of attendances will also continue. Government have announced earlier that the DCs and SACs will operate for six months and this remains our plan.
- (d) The private medical sector: Screening service is available in the private hospitals and by medical doctors. Although they are requested to report cases to CHP, we have no information on the number of screenings

- 4 -

conducted by the private medical sector.

#### **Medical Treatment**

- 8. Given the novel nature of the MTMP disorders and the lack of any human literature (and scant animal studies), there is as yet no widely accepted consensus on clinical epidemiologic features, screening, diagnosis and management. The Group sent a delegation to Mainland from 28 to 30 September 2008 to gather information and exchange experience on the screening and clinical management of children affected by MTMP. Working with our local experts, drawing from the knowledge we gain in Mainland, and researching literatures published by the World Health Organization (WHO) and others overseas institutions, the Group deliberated on the case definition, reporting criteria, clinical management (screening, diagnosis and treatment) and scope of further studies/research on MTMP disorders. The recommendations are set out below:
  - Surveillance case definition: According to the WHO, a (a) case for surveillance purpose is defined as "an infant with kidney stones or other kidney problems (e.g. anuria, renal failure) having consumed powdered infant formula produced in China before 6 August 2008, and where other potential causes of kidney stones have been excluded by differential diagnosis". Drawing on this reference and clinical experience, the Group endorsed the adoption of a set of more specific case definitions in three categories, namely "suspected case, probable case and confirmed case". These definitions are in **Annex F**. CHP will communicate with MoH and WHO to relay Hong Kong's set of case definitions and disseminate the same to local health professionals. The proposed set of definitions will be revisited from time to time, as and when new information becomes available reference from scientific consensus internationally.
  - (b) **Reporting criteria**: The present reporting criteria used by CHP should continue to be used, i.e. "any child

- 5 -

presenting with renal diseases including calculi and with history of exposure to melamine containing dairy product".

- (c) Clinical Management: HA will communicate with private sector clinicians regarding HA's current screening, diagnosis and treatment principles which have been promulgated within HA. HA will revisit the referral criteria from DC to SAC, taking into account new evidence and empirical experience and other service factors.
- (d) **Data analysis**: HA will systematically analyse the data collected at DCs and SACs. The results will be used for further risk assessment and risk communication, and for refinement of referral criteria and clinical management protocols.
- (e) Government will commission research to assess the potential medium to long term health effects associated with melamine exposure including laboratory studies and basic science research. These should take the form of multi partite collaboration between DH, HA and the universities.
- (f) FHB will maintain close liaison with the Mainland MoH on developments and exchange views and experience.

# Food Safety, Supply and Control

9. The Group noted that the CFS has taken a series of measures to ensure food safety since the discovery of melamine in Mainland infant formula. These include conducting tests on milk and dairy products in the market; making daily announcements on the test results and the latest developments; setting up an enquiry hotline to answer public enquiries about problem food; maintaining close liaison with the trade, overseas and Mainland authorities; monitoring any relevant findings and studies on melamine in food

- 6 -

conducted locally or in overseas jurisdiction; and introducing legislation to regulate the level of melamine in food. FHB has also liaised closely with major importers of infant formula to ensure a stable supply of the product. The Group took note of CFS's work progress and recommendations, which are set out below:

- Surveillance and sampling: CFS has been conducting (a) tests through the Government Laboratory (GL) on milk and dairy products on a systematic basis since 11 September 2008. As at 19 October 2008, CFS has conducted tests and announced the test results on over 2,692 samples, of which 32 (covering 15 brands) were found to contain melamine above the legal limits. implicated products have been withdrawn from the market and the importers concerned have recalled the product on the advice of CFS. Since infants and young children of 36 months old or below are the most vulnerable group, CFS has given top priority to testing infant formula and food for babies. All infant formula in the local market have been tested (84 samples) and the results comply with the legal standard. The Group endorses a priority list for testing of food types with milk content in descending order as follows: infant milk powder and infant food; raw milk/fresh milk; dairy products; dairy based desserts/confectioneries; beverages drinks: cereals and cereal products; preserves/confectionaries containing milk products; soups, sauces, gravies and salad cream. The test results are published daily through press releases and the websites of CFS and FHB.
- (b) Surveillance Strategy: In light of the progress and testing results, CFS shall adjust the focus of the upcoming surveillance programme and map out the long-term testing strategy. As recommended by the Group, CFS shall extend the scope of testing to cover Mainland raw materials commonly used in manufacturing local food products. To this end, CFS

- 7 -

has contacted the major retailers to seek their support in providing market information.

(c) **Testing Programme**: The Group observed that in the first round of the surveillance from mid September to mid October, about 60-100 samples are tested everyday and a total of over 2,000 have been tested in less than a month's time. The test results show that the number of problem food is about 1% of the total products sampled. Taking the results into account, and the increased emphasis on control at source, CFS will further revise its testing programme. Given the relatively higher risk associated with infant formula and food pregnant/lactating women, testing of the relevant products will continue in the second round (for two weeks from late October to early November 2008). measure of testing every consignment of raw milk and pasteurized/UHT milk from the Mainland (which started on 25 September 2008) will continue. Besides snack food with milk ingredient from the Mainland, CFS will also test more products with no milk content but may be subject to melamine contamination (e.g. meat, vegetables and processed food). With a more targeted approach and increased emphasis on control at source in the second round, the Group endorsed that CFS will gradually adjust the quantity of the samples to be tested from 100 per day to around 100 per week.

The Group recommended CFS to conduct a review at the end of the 3-month period to determine the frequency and targeted products testing as part of the routine surveillance programme. Apart from monitoring the situation through testing, CFS will also require importers to provide appropriate certification on the melamine content of the food, should they intend to import products that have been found failing the legal standard under the surveillance.

- 8 -

- (d) Regulatory standards of melamine in food: The Group noted that FHB and CFS have expeditiously studied the international practice to set a standard which is applicable to local circumstances and amended the Harmful Substances in Food Regulation (Cap 132AF) to set the legal limit of melamine at -
  - 1mg/kg for milk, any food intended to be consumed principally by children under the age of 36 months and any food intended to be consumed principally by pregnant or lactating women; and
  - 2.5mg/kg for other food.

The Harmful Substances in Food (Amendment) Regulation 2008 was gazetted on 23 September 2008 and came into force the same day. It has been tabled at LegCo on 8 October 2008.

The Group observed that these standards are set with reference to the US Food and Drug Administration (FDA) and are in line with the standards promulgated by most places that have set standards for melamine in food, e.g. New Zealand and Canada. The approach in the Amendment Regulation is considered appropriate to protect public health. CFS will closely monitor international developments in the setting of standards for melamine analogues (which may produce adverse health effects if found present with melamine) and review the current melamine standards accordingly. GL is also working on method development for cyanuric acid and other analogues of melamine.

(e) **GL testing capability**: The Group noted that GL has taken reference of the US FDA quantitative method in its testing of milk powder and dairy products. It provides CFS with an express analytical service to ensure that analytical results are available within 24 hours. With

- 9 .

overtime work and redeployment of resources, GL is able to analyse about 100 food samples for melamine per day. But such intense testing of food samples for a prolonged period will affect its other services and FHB will review the medium and long term resource requirements of GL.

- (f) **Testing capability of private laboratories**: The Group took note that some private laboratories are already offering service to the trade for melamine testing. In addition, a number of local private laboratories are said to have acquired the necessary instruments for melamine testing. GL organized a technical seminar on the chemical testing of melamine in dairy products for the private laboratories on 23 September 2008.
- (g) Further legislative measures: FHB will accord top priority to making legislative amendments to the Public Health and Municipal Services Ordinance (Cap 132) to empower the authorities to where necessary issue orders to prohibit import and sale, and order recall of problem food. FHB intends to introduce the Amendment Bill into the Legislative Council in November 2008.

#### Communication with the Public

- 10. The Group is keenly aware of public concerns on the incident and considers it highly important to make timely and clear announcements to the public on CFS food testing results, HA's screening services for eligible children and CHP's melamine surveillance reports. These are done daily as mentioned above and we will continue to do so. We will also closely monitor developments in the Mainland and other countries and announce any action we may take arising from these developments.
- 11. The Group also considers it useful to provide the public, particularly parents with health information relating to MTMP disorders. We have invited clinical experts to explain to the public, the potential health effects of melamine tainted milk and dairy

- 10 -

products. The HA has organized two public health talks on 4 and 5 October 2008. The HA also distributes a note to parents when they bring their children to the DCs on the screening procedures which the children will undergo so as to ease their anxieties. Through the Education Bureau, we have also distributed a pamphlet to schools and parents on the toxicity of Melamine and health effects.

### Inter Bureau and Departmental Co-ordination

With the Group taking the lead, all Bureaux and 12. Departments concerned have worked smoothly and effectively in addressing the range of issues. The Department of Justice have provided FHB with timely legal advice and drafts of legislative amendments. The Security Bureau and Immigration Department have promptly collected and collated the land and ferry control points arrival and departure statistics for FHB on a daily basis since 28 September 2008. The Education Bureau has helped to disseminate information to schools and parents. The Information Services Department has worked with FHB closely on our daily public announcements and response to the media. deployed resources to handle public enquiries, worked with HA to meet the service demands and participated in the clinical studies. HA staff have worked overtime, rising to the challenge in serving the public in the DCs and SACs and have worked smoothly with The Group will enlist the government departments concerned. support of other departments if necessary.

# Non- officials

13. The Expert Group Chairman is grateful to the non-officials who serve on the Group and its Sub-groups for their expert advice and contributions to the deliberations of the Group.

### Way Forward

14. The Expert Group will take forward the recommendations set out above and ensure that its tasks, as set out in its Terms of Reference, are promptly and effectively discharged.

- 11

The three Sub-groups will closely monitor implementation and report progress to the Expert Group in three months' time. We will remain vigilant on any new development and endeavour to address with top priority, public concerns on the issue. We will keep the Chief Secretary for Administration apprised of our work.

Expert Group on Melamine Incident Food and Health Bureau Government Secretariat 20 October 2008

- 12 -

# 三聚氰胺事件專家小組報告 <u>呈交政務司司長</u> <u>(二零零八年十月二十日)</u>

#### 簡介

二零零八年九月,內地生產的嬰兒奶粉驗出含有三聚氰胺,而內地亦有嬰兒和兒童,因飲用這些受三聚氰胺污染的奶及乳類產品,而出現腎石和患上腎衰竭。事件一經發現,食物及衞生局隨即採取行動,以回應本港市民對食物安全的關注,評估事件對可能曾飲用受污染奶及乳類產品的嬰兒和兒童的健康影響,並設立專為 12 歲或以下兒童而設的公共醫療服務,為他們進行健康檢查。

### 成立三聚氰胺事件專家小組

- 2. 當局在二零零八年九月二十六日成立三聚氰胺事件專家小組(專家小組),由食物及衞生局局長擔任主席,以確保本港市民的健康獲得保障。專家小組的職權範圍載於附件 A。專家小組的成員來自公營和私營的各個界別,包括學術界、醫學界、公共衞生、食物安全及公眾宣傳方面的專家,以及多個政府決策局和部門的代表,成員名單載於附件 B。專家小組之下另設三個工作組,分別是醫療服務工作組、治療工作組和食物安全供應及管制工作組,專責研究不同事宜。三個工作組的職權範圍和成員名單,分別載於附件 C、D 和 E。
- 3. 專家小組先後於二零零八年九月二十六日和十月二十日舉行了兩次會議,各工作組也分別舉行了一次會議。本報告在二零零八年十月二十日的專家小組會議上獲得通過。

## 專家小組的工作進度及建議

## <u>目前情況</u>

4. 我們的公共醫療服務一直能應付各方面的需求。醫院管理局(醫管局)的 18 間指定普通科門診診所及 9 間特別評估中心能應付為本港 12 歲或以下兒童進行健康檢查的需求。雖然在二零零八年九月底檢查服務開展初期,接受檢查的人數較多,但現時人數已經穩定,並有下降趨勢。醫管局至今為 10 個呈報個案提供了治療。衛生署衛生防護中心進行的監察工作,亦充分發揮功能,每日收集、整理和發放有關個案報告的資料。市民對該中心電話熱線服務的需求初期較為殷切,但現已下降。

- 5. 雖然由三聚氰胺污染奶類製品引起的病症屬新病例,但本港臨狀專家可從內地和本港醫院收集資料,並就個案定義、診斷和臨牀治理提出建議。我們現正考慮作進一步臨牀醫學觀察及科研。

### 衛生事務

- 7. 為消除市民的憂慮,食物及衞生局認為必須就市民對本身及子女健康的疑問作出回應,同時,亦須在公營醫療界別為 12歲或以下合資格的本港兒童,提供免費和方便的健康檢查服務、與私營醫療界別作出協調,以便每日就全港情況作出評估,以及確保政府提供的健康檢查服務可應付需求。為此署的及衞生局要求每日收取各項有關服務的報告,包括衞生署轄下衞生防護中心的電話熱線服務、公營及私營醫療機構提交的個案報告、醫管局 18 間指定普通科門診診所及 9 間特別評估中心的處理能力和接受檢查人數,以及陸路及水路的出入境管制站的出入境人數,包括持回港證的 11 歲以下兒童的出入境情況。專家小組的觀察所得及建議如下:
  - (a) **衞生防護中心**:根據每日的電話查詢數目,市民對事件最關注的期間為九月底。自二零零八年九月二十一日設立每日上午九時至下午五時的電話熱線服務以來,在二零零八年九月二十三至二十六日期間,衞生防護中心每天共處理超過1,000宗電話查詢,最高記錄是在二零零八年九月二十五日,當天共接獲1,876宗查詢。其後查詢數目大幅減少,至二零零八年十月十八日期間,衞生防護中心共處理9,866宗電話查詢。專家小組贊同,熱線應繼續在平日及星期六上午的辦公時間提供服務,但由於需求減少,因此可停止星期六下午及星期日的服務。

- 2 -

- (b) **衞生防護中心個案報告**:截至二零零八年十月十九日,衞生防護中心共接獲十宗個案報告,其中兩宗由私人醫療機構呈報,四宗來自醫管局轄下的特別評估中心,四宗來自醫管局其他單位。這項通報安排及每日公布個案報告的做法,應繼續實行,直至另行通知為止。
- 醫管局的指定門診診所及特別評估中心: 醫管局自二 零零八年九月二十三日起共設立 18 間指定門診診所及 9 間特別評估中心。平均來說,指定診所每日為 2,000 名兒童提供服務,但在星期六、日及學校假期,求診 人數有所增加。二零零八年九月二十七日星期六的求 診人數最多, 合共 4,160 人; 十月一日國慶日, 人數回 落至 3,598 人; 十月十八日星期六, 人數為 976 人。特 別評估中心平均每日為 500 至 600 名兒童進行檢查。 雖然無法得知有多少在內地居住的在港出生兒童曾經 來港進行檢查,但根據國慶假期的接受檢查人數顯 示 , 服 務 需 求 並 無 異 常 激 增 , 而 增 幅 亦 與 本 港 學 校 假 期腔合。在國慶假期期間,醫管局曾延長開放時間, 而衞生署亦調派人手至醫管局增援。截至二零零八年 十月十八日,醫管局的指定診所總共為 41,748 兒童檢 查及在特別評估中心為 12,394 兒童作評估。現時指定 診 所 及 特 別 評 估 中 心 已 恢 復 正 常 開 放 時 間 。 專 家 小 組 認為, 目前安排可以繼續, 但當局應密切監察服務需 求情況,如有需要便當調整服務時間。此外,當局亦 應繼續每日通報及公布接受檢查人數。政府較早前已 宣布,指定診所及特別評估中心會提供為期六個月的 服務。我們將按此繼續安排服務。
- (d) 私營醫療機構:私家醫院和醫生目前亦有提供檢查服務。雖然當局已要求他們向衞生防護中心報告病例個案,但我們没有私營醫療機構檢查人數的全部數目。

# <u>治療方法</u>

8. 由於受三聚氰胺污染的奶類產品所引致的疾病屬新病例,缺乏任何人類醫療文獻(動物方面的研究亦非常少),因此在臨床流行病學特徵、身體檢查、診斷和治理方式方面,尚未有廣泛的共識。專家小組在二零零八年九月二十八日至三十日派出代表團往內地,就三聚氰胺污染奶類產品所影響的兒童的身體檢查和臨床治理事宜,收集資料和交流經驗。專家小組與本地專家共同合作,並參考從內地所得的知識,以及研究世界衞生組織(世衞)和其他海外機構發表的文獻後,詳細討論了下列事項,

- 3 -

包括個案定義、呈報準則、臨牀治理(檢查、診斷和治療方法),以及就受三聚氰胺污染奶類產品所引致的疾病,作進一步研究的範圍。專家小組並提出下列建議:

- (a) 監察個案的定義:根據世衞的定義,監察個案是指"曾在二零零八年八月六日前食用中國製嬰兒配方奶粉並患有腎石或其他腎臟問題(例如尿閉症及腎衰竭)的嬰兒,而鑑別診斷又排除腎石是由其他可能成因所引致"。根據這項參考指引及臨牀經驗,專家小組通過採用一套更明確的個案定義,將個案分為三類:懷疑病例、臨床病例及確診病例。有關定義載於附件 F。衛生防護中心會把香港的個案定義轉達中國衞生部及世衞,並通知本地的醫護人員。我們將密切留意各國科學界就個案定義達成的最新共識,不時檢視上述定義。
- (b) **呈報準則**: 衞生防護中心現行的呈報準則應繼續使用,即"任何呈腎病(包括結石)症狀並曾食用含三聚氰胺乳類產品的兒童"。
- (c) **臨牀治理**:醫管局會把內部頒布並現正採用的檢查、 診斷及治療原則,通知私營界別的醫生。醫管局日後 會根據各項新證據與實際經驗,以及其他服務因素, 重新檢視指定普通科門診診所,把個案轉介至特別評 估中心的準則。
- (d) 數據分析:醫管局會有系統地分析由指定普通科門診 診所及特別評估中心收集所得的數據。有關結果會用 作進一步風險評估及風險傳達,以及改進個案轉介準 則及臨牀治理工作常規。
- (e) 政府會委託機構研究三聚氰胺對人類健康可能造成的中、長期影響,包括進行實驗室研究及基本科學研究。這些工作應以衞生署、醫管局及大學多方合作的形式進行。
- (f) 食物及衛生局會就事件的發展與中國衛生部保持緊密聯繫,並交流意見及經驗。

# 食物安全、供應及管制

9. 專家小組留意到,自內地嬰兒奶粉發現含有三聚氰胺後, 食物安全中心已採取一連串措施,以確保食物安全。這些措施 包括為市面上的奶及乳類產品進行檢測;每日公布檢測結果及 最新發展;設立查詢熱線答覆市民對問題食物的查詢;與業界、海外和內地機關保持密切聯繫;留意任何本地或海外國家就食物含有三聚氰胺所作的相關調查及研究所得結果;以及立法規管食物內三聚氰胺的含量。同時 ,食物及衞生局亦與嬰兒奶粉主要進口商保持密切聯繫,以確保產品供應情況穩定。專家小組備悉食物安全中心以下的工作進度及建議:

- **監察及抽取樣本**:自二零零八年九月十一日以來,食 (a) 物安全中心一直透過政府化驗所對奶及乳類產品進行 有系統的檢測。截至二零零八年十月十九日,食物安 全中心已就 2,692 多個樣本進行檢測及公布檢測結果, 發現其中 32 個(涉及 15 個品牌)所含的三聚氰胺高於法 定上限。全部有問題產品已從市場撤回,有關進口商 亦已按照食物安全中心的建議,回收有關產品。由於 嬰兒和 36 個月或以下的幼兒最容易受到傷害,因此食 物安全中心已優先檢測嬰兒奶粉及嬰兒食品。本地市 場所有嬰兒奶粉已進行檢測(84個樣本),結果全部附 合法例要求。專家小組亦通過各種含奶類成分的食品 的優先檢測名單,優次順序如下:嬰兒奶粉及嬰兒食 品;未經加工奶類/鮮奶;乳類產品;以乳類為主的 甜品/甜食;飲料及飲品;穀類及穀類製品;含奶類 產品的醃製品/甜食;湯水、醬料、肉汁及沙律醬。 檢測結果每日以新聞稿形式及在食物安全中心和食物 及衞生局的網站公布。
- (b) **監察策略**:食物安全中心會因應工作進度及檢測結果,調整下一個監察計劃的重點,以及制定長遠的檢測策略。食物安全中心會參照專家小組的建議,擴大檢測範圍,以包括本地食品慣常使用的內地原材料。 為此,食物安全中心已聯絡主要的零售商,要求提供市場資料。

- 5 -

檢測更多不含奶類成分但卻可能會受到三聚氰胺污染的食品(例如肉類、蔬菜和經加工處理的食物)。在第二輪的檢測中,由於食物安全中心採取更針對性的處理方式,並更為着重源頭監控工作,專家小組同意中心逐步調節檢測樣本的數量,由每日 100 個調低至每周100 個。

專家小組建議,食物安全中心可在三個月監察期完結後進行檢討,以決定進行檢測的目標產品及頻密度,作為恆常監察計劃的一部分。除了進行檢測以監察有關情況外,食物安全中心如曾發現不符合法定標準的食品,會要求擬進口該等食品的進口商提交有關食品三聚氰胺含量的適當證明文件。

- (d) 對食物含三聚氰胺的規管標準:專家小組注意到,食物及衛生局和食物安全中心已迅速研究國際上的做法,以釐定本地適用的標準,並修訂《食物內有害物質規例》(第 132AF 章),把三聚氰胺的法定上限訂定如下一
  - 奶類、擬主要供 36 個月以下幼兒食用的任何食物和擬主要供懷孕或授乳的女性食用的任何食物的上限為每公斤食物含 1 毫克;以及
  - 一 任何其他食物的上限為每公斤食物含 2.5 毫克。

《 2008 年食物內有害物質(修訂)規例》於二零零八年 九月二十三日刊登憲報,並同日生效。該修訂規例已 於二零零八年十月八日提交立法會。

專家小組觀察到,這些標準是參考美國食物及藥物管理局的規定而制定,並與大部分已就食物所含三聚氰胺制定標準的地方(例如新西蘭及加拿大)所頒布的標準一致。對保障市民健康來說,實施修訂規例的內容是恰當的做法。另外,由於三聚氰胺類似品(如含於三聚氰胺)也會對健康造成不良影響,食物安全中心發展聚氰胺)也會對健康造成不良影響,食物安全中心發展不良影響,食物安全中心發展不良影響,食物安全中心發展不良,食物安全,食物安全,食物。

(e) 政府化驗所的檢測能力:專家小組注意到,政府化驗所在檢測奶及乳類產品時參照了美國食品及藥物管理局的量化方法。政府化驗所為食物安全中心提供特快分析服務,以確保中心可在 24 小時內取得分析結果。政府化驗所經安排人員 超時工作及重新調配資源後,

- 6 -

可在一天內分析 100 個食物樣本,以確定是否含三聚 氰胺。但政府化驗所如長期進行如此密集的食物樣本 檢測,將會影響該部門的其他服務。為此,食物及衞 生局會檢討政府化驗所的中長期資源需求。

- (f) 私家化驗所的檢測能力:專家小組亦注意到,有些私家化驗所已為業界提供檢測三聚氰胺的服務。此外,一些本地私家化驗所據報亦購置了檢測三聚氰胺所需的儀器。二零零八年九月二十三日,政府化驗所為私家化驗所舉辦技術研討會,簡介有關乳類產品所含三聚氰胺的化學檢測。
- (g) **進一步立法措施**:食物及衞生局會優先處理《公眾衞生及市政條例》(第 132 章)的法例修訂工作,賦權當局在有需要時發出命令以禁止有問題食品入口及出售,以及下令回收有關產品。食物及衞生局擬於二零零八年十一月向立法會提交該《修訂條例草案》。

#### 與公眾溝通

- 10. 專家小組深明公眾對事件的關注,並認為當局及時向公眾明確公布各項有關資料至為重要,包括食物安全中心的食品檢測結果、醫管局為合資格兒童提供的檢查服務,以及衞生防護中心的三聚氰胺監察報告。如前所述,我們每日都作出公布,並會繼續這樣做。我們亦會密切留意內地及其他國家的事態進展,並公布我們因應這些進展情況所可能採取的行動。
- 11. 專家小組亦認為,向市民特別是家長提供有關三聚氰胺污染奶類產品所引起的病症方面的健康資料,十分有用。我們邀請醫學專家向公眾解釋有關食用受三聚氰胺污染的奶及乳類食物對健康的影响。醫管局在二零零八年十月四日及五日舉辦兩場健康講座,並向所有帶同子女前往指定普通科門診診所進行健康檢查的家長派發資料單張,讓他們了解有關檢查程序,以減輕他們的憂慮。此外,我們亦通過教育局向學校及家長派發有關三聚氰胺毒性及對健康影響的小冊子。

# <u>決策局及部門之間的合作</u>

12. 在專家小組帶領下,各有關的決策局及部門已順利而有效地處理多項事宜。律政司為食物及衞生局提供了適時的法律意見,以及草擬有關的法例修訂建議。保安局和入境事務處已由二零零八年九月二十八日起,迅速收集和整理每日經陸路及水路的出入境管制站抵港/離港的人士的統計數字,供食物及衞

- 7 -

生局參考。至於教育局,則協助向學校和家長發放有關資訊。 政府新聞處亦與食物及衞生局緊密合作,每日向本港市民公布 有關資訊,以及回應傳媒。衞生署已調撥資源解答市民查詢, 並與醫管局攜手合作,應付有關服務需求和參與臨牀研究。醫 管局人員亦積極面對挑戰,在指定門診診所和特別評估中心加 班工作,服務市民,並與有關的政府部門合作無間。在有需要 時,專家小組會請其他部門提供支援。

## <u>非公職人士</u>

13. 專家小組主席感謝擔任小組及工作組成員的非公職人士,提供專家意見及建議,供專家小組考慮。

### 未來路向

14. 專家小組會推行上文所述的建議,並確保其職權範圍所載的各項職務能迅速而有效地完成。三個工作組會密切監察各項建議的落實,並在三個月內,向專家小組報告進度。我們會對事件的最新發展保持警覺,並把釋除公眾疑慮列為首要工作。我們會繼續向政務司司長報告工作的最新進展。

政府總部

食物及衞生局

- 三聚氰胺事件專家小組
- 二零零八年十月二十日

- 8 -

# 三聚氰胺事件專家小組 Expert Group on Melamine Incident

# 職權範圍 Terms of Reference

(一)確保公營醫療系統的人力及配套設施,能爲受三聚 氰胺事件影響市民提供適當的身體檢驗及治療,及 制訂有效的檢驗及治療程序及方法,和建議有關醫 療衛生服務的跟進措施。

To ensure that the manpower and supporting facilities of the public healthcare system can provide appropriate medical assessment and treatment for those citizens affected by the melamine incident, to formulate effective procedures and methods for medical assessment and treatment and to propose follow-up measures on medical and health services.

(二) 評估事件的影響,確保對有關奶品及相關食品進行 有效監察和檢驗,保障市民健康。

> To assess the impact of the incident and ensure effective monitoring and inspection on dairy products and related food in order to protect the health of citizens.

(三) 就對有問題食品限制輸入、銷售及作出回收的最快速及切實可行的立法工作提出建議。

To make proposals on the practical and expeditious means to legislate to prohibit import and sale, and order recall of problem food.

(四)制訂向公眾發佈有關的資料,及完善發佈的方法、時間、內容等。

To consider the most effective method, timing and content, etc to disseminate information to the public.

(五) 密切監察事件發展,包括內地居住的香港兒童來港 尋求醫療服務的情况,及落實相關的有效應變措 施,包括在學校,口岸及私營醫療服務等方面。

To closely monitor the situation and development of the incident, including the situation regarding Hong Kong children residing in the Mainland coming to Hong Kong to seek medical services, and to put in place effective response measures at schools, border control points and private medical service organizations, etc.

# **Expert Group on Melamine Incident**

Membership List

Chairman Dr York CHOW

Secretary for Food and Health

Vice Chairman Ms Sandra LEE

Permanent Secretary for Food and Health (Health)

#### **Members** I. **Government Representatives**

Representatives of Food and Health Bureau Representatives of Department of Justice Representatives of Education Bureau Representatives of Security Bureau

Representatives of Department of Health

Representatives of Food and Environmental Hygiene

Department

Representatives of Government Laboratory Representatives of Immigration Department Representatives of Information Services Department

(Representatives of other Bureaux and Departments will

attend as necessary)

#### II. **Representatives of Hospital Authority**

#### III. **Representatives of Consumer Council**

#### Non-officio members IV.

Professor FOK Tai-fai Dean of Medicine The Chinese University of Hong Kong

Professor TAM Kwong-hang, Paul Pro-Vice-Chancellor and Vice-President The University of Hong Kong

Professor YEUNG Chung-kwong President, The College of Surgeons of Hong Kong

Dr CHIU Man-chun Chief of Service / Consultant Department of Paediatrics & Adolescent Medicine Princess Margaret Hospital

Dr MAN Chi-wai
Deputy Chief of Service / Consultant Urologist
Department of Surgery
Tuen Mun Hospital

Dr CHOW Chun-bong
Consultant
Department of Paediatrics & Adolescent Medicine
Princess Margaret Hospital

Dr LUI Siu-fai Consultant (Quality & Risk Management) Hospital Authority

Professor YUEN Kwok-yung Chair of Infectious Diseases and Head Department of Microbiology, The University of Hong Kong

Dr LO Chi-kin Managing Director, C.K. Lo & S. Lam Ltd

Professor KWAN Hoi-shan Dean, Faculty of Science Professor, Department of Biology The Chinese University of Hong Kong

Professor CHAN Yan-keung, Thomas Professor and Honorary Consultant Physician Department of Medicine and Therapeutics The Chinese University of Hong Kong Mr WONG Ka-wo, Simon President Hong Kong Federation of Restaurants and Related Trades

Mr Allen HO Director of Food Safety and Quality Assurance, Dairy Farm Group, Hong Kong

# 三聚氰胺事件專家小組

成員名單

主席 食物及衞生局局長周一嶽醫生

副主席 食物及衞生局常任秘書長(衞生)李淑儀女士

I. 政府代表

成員食物及衞生局代表

律政司代表

教育局代表

保安局代表

衞生署代表

食物環境衞生署代表

政府化驗所代表

入境事務處代表

政府新聞處代表

(其它政策局及部門按需要出席)

- II. 醫院管理局代表
- III. 消費者委員會代表
- IV. 非官方成員

霍泰輝教授 香港中文大學醫學院院長

譚廣亨教授 香港大學副校長

楊重光教授香港外科醫學院院長

趙孟準醫生 部門主管/瑪嘉烈醫院兒童及青少年科顧問 醫生 文志衛醫生 署任部門主管 屯門醫院泌尿外科顧問醫生

周鎭邦醫生瑪嘉烈醫院兒童及青少年科顧問醫生

雷兆輝醫生醫院管理局顧問醫生(質素及風險管理)

袁國勇教授 香港大學講座教授(傳染病學)及微生物學系 主任

盧子健博士盧子健林乃仁顧問有限公司董事經理

關海山教授 香港中文大學理學院院長 香港中文大學生物系教授

陳恩強教授 香港中文大學內科及藥物治療學系教授

黃家和先生 香港餐飲聯業協會會長

何兆桓先生 香港牛奶公司集團食品安全/品質管理董事

# 三聚氰胺事件專家小組 食物安全供應及管制工作組 Food Safety, Supply and Control Sub-group of the Expert Group on Melamine Incident

# 職權範圍 Terms of Reference

(一) 研究爲奶類及相關受三聚氰胺污染的食品進行有效 檢驗的策略。

To work out the strategy for effective monitoring and inspection on dairy products and food contaminated by melamine.

(二) 研究在港供應食物受三聚氰胺污染的問題,並就事件對一般食物安全進行風險評估。

To study the problem of the contamination of food supply by melamine in Hong Kong, and to conduct risk assessment in regard to the impact of the incident on general food safety.

# 三聚氰胺事件專家小組 食物安全供應及管制工作組

# Food Safety, Supply and Control Sub-group of the Expert Group on Melamine Incident

# 成員名單 Membership List

# 主席

#### Chairman

孔郭惠清女士 食物及衛生局常任秘書長(食物) Mrs Stella HUNG Permanent Secretary for Food and Health (Food)

## 成員

#### Members

陳恩強教授 香港中文大學內科及藥物治療學系教授 Professor CHAN Yan-keung, Thomas Professor and Honorary Consultant Physician Department of Medicine and Therapeutics The Chinese University of Hong Kong

何兆桓先生 香港牛奶公司集團食品安全/品質管理董事 Mr Allen HO Director of Food Safety and Quality Assurance, Dairy Farm Group, Hong Kong

關海山教授 香港中文大學理學院院長 香港中文大學生物系教授 Professor KWAN Hoi-shan Dean, Faculty of Science Professor, Department of Biology The Chinese University of Hong Kong 盧子健博士

盧子健林乃仁顧問有限公司董事經理

Dr LO Chi-kin

Managing Director, C.K. Lo & S. Lam Ltd

黄家和先生

香港餐飲聯業協會會長

Mr WONG Ka-wo, Simon

President, Hong Kong Federation of Restaurants and Related Trades

袁國勇教授

香港大學講座教授(傳染病學)及微生物學系主任

Professor YUEN Kwok-yung

Chair of Infectious Diseases and Head, Department of Microbiology The University of Hong Kong

劉燕卿女士

消費者委員會總幹事

Ms Connie LAU

Chief Executive, Consumer Council

卓永興先生

食物環境衞生署署長

Mr W H CHEUK

Director of Food and Environmental Hygiene

聶世蘭女士

食物及衛生局副秘書長(食物)

Ms Olivia NIP

Deputy Secretary for Food and Health (Food)

陳漢儀醫生

食物安全中心食物安全專員

Dr Constance CHAN

Controller, Centre for food Safety

丁大倫博士

政府化驗師

Dr TING Tai-lun

**Government Chemist** 

附件 C Annex C

梁肇輝博士

漁農自然護理署助理署長(漁業)

Dr S F LEUNG

Assistant Director (Fisheries)

Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation Department

莫天娜醫生

衞生署首席醫生(5)

Dr Tina MOK

Principal Medical and Health Officer (5)

Department of Health

# 三聚氰胺事件專家小組 醫療服務工作組 Health Services Sub-group of the Expert Group on Melamine Incident

# 職權範圍 Terms of Reference

(一) 研究及評估含有三聚氰胺污染的奶品及相關食品對 市民,尤其是兒童,包括在內地居住的香港兒童, 及其他高風險人士的健康造成的影響。

To study and assess the impact of melamine contaminated dairy products and related food on citizens, particularly children including Hong Kong children residing in the Mainland, and other high-risk groups.

(二)確保公營醫療系統的人力及相關配套設施,能爲受影響市民提供適當的身體檢驗及治療,並經常檢討服務需求及情況。

To ensure that the manpower and related supporting facilities of the public healthcare system can provide appropriate medical assessment and treatment for affected citizens, and to conduct regular review of the situation and service demand.

# 三聚氰胺事件專家小組 醫療服務工作組

# Health Services Sub-group of the Expert Group on Melamine Incident

# 成員名單 Membership List

# 主席

#### Chairman

李淑儀女士 食物及衞生局常任秘書長(衞生) Ms Sandra LEE Permanent Secretary for Food and Health (Health)

# 成員

#### Members

霍泰輝教授 香港中文大學醫學院院長 Professor FOK Tai-fai Dean of Medicine, The Chinese University of Hong Kong

譚廣亨教授 香港大學副校長 Professor TAM Kwong-hang, Paul Pro-Vice-Chancellor and Vice-President, The University of Hong Kong

黄家和先生 香港餐飲聯業協會會長 Mr WONG Ka-wo, Simon

President, Hong Kong Federation of Restaurants and Related Trades

張 偉 麟 醫 生 醫 院 管 理 局 聯 網 服 務 總 監 Dr W L CHEUNG Director (Cluster Services), Hospital Authority 鄭信恩醫生

醫院管理局總行政經理(聯網運作)

Dr Beatrice CHENG

Chief Manager (Cluster Performance), Hospital Authority

黎潔廉醫生

衞生署助理署長

Dr Cindy LAI

Assistant Director of Health (Health Administration & Planning)

羅應祺先生

保安局首席助理秘書長C

Mr Alan LO

Principal Assistant Secretary for Security C

陳孟麟先生

入境事務處助理處長(管制)

Mr CHAN Man-lang

Assistant Director of Immigration (Control)

謝祥興先生

新聞處助理處長(1)(本地公共關係)

Mr TSE Cheung-hing

Assistant Director of Information Services(1)(Local Public Relations)

譚貫枝先生

教育局首席教育主任(港島)

Mr TAM Koon-che

Principal Education Officer (HK), Education Bureau

# 三聚氰胺事件專家小組 治療工作組

# Treatment Sub-group of the Expert Group on Melamine Incident

# 職權範圍 Terms of Reference

(一) 制訂有效的檢驗及治療程序及方法,並建議有關醫療衛生的跟進措施。

To formulate effective procedures and methods for medical assessment and treatment, and to propose follow-up measures on medical and health services.

(二) 参考內地及海外的治療經驗,並就本地個案作醫學研究。

To make reference to the treatment experience in the Mainland and overseas, and to conduct medical research on local cases.

# 三聚氰胺事件專家小組 治療工作組

# Treatment Sub-group of the Expert Group on Melamine Incident

成員名單 Membership List

# 主席

#### Chairman

梁卓偉教授 食物及衞生局副局長 Prof Gabriel M LEUNG Under Secretary for Food and Health

### 成員

#### **Members**

陳恩強教授 香港中文大學內科及藥物治療學系教授 Professor CHAN Yan-keung, Thomas Professor and Honorary Consultant Physician Department of Medicine and Therapeutics The Chinese University of Hong Kong

趙孟準醫生

部門主管/瑪嘉烈醫院兒童及青少年科顧問醫生

Dr CHIU Man-chun

Chief of Service / Consultant, Department of Paediatrics & Adolescent Medicine, Princess Margaret Hospital

霍泰輝教授 香港中文大學醫學院院長

Professor FOK Tai-fai

Dean of Medicine, The Chinese University of Hong Kong

藍章翔醫生

私人執業兒科醫生 Dr LAM Cheung-cheung, Barbara Private Paediatrician

劉宇隆教授

香港大學兒童及青少年科學系講座教授兼系主任

Professor LAU Yu-lung

Chair Professor & Head

Department of Paediatrics and Adolescent Medicine,

The University of Hong Kong

李醒芬醫生

放射科專科醫生

北區醫院放射診斷部部門主管

Dr LEE Sing-fun, Paul

Specialist in Radiology

Chief of Service (Radiology), North District Hospital

梁挺雄醫生

衞生防護中心

社會醫學顧問醫生(非傳染病),監測及流行病學處主任

Dr LEUNG Ting-hung

Consultant Community Medicine (Non-Communicable Disease) &

Head, Surveillance & Epidemiology Branch, Centre for Health Protection

雷兆輝醫生

醫院管理局顧問醫生(質素及風險管理)

Dr LUI Siu-fai

Consultant (Quality & Risk Management), Hospital Authority

麥永禮醫生

瑪嘉烈醫院顧問醫生

毒理學參考化驗室

Dr W L MAK, Tony

Consultant Chemical Pathologist

Toxicology Reference Laboratory, Department of Pathology

Princess Margaret Hospital

文志衛醫生

署任部門主管

屯門醫院泌尿外科顧問醫生

Dr MAN Chi-wai

Deputy Chief of Service / Consultant Urologist, Department of Surgery Tuen Mun Hospital

彭飛舟醫生

醫院管理局署理總行政經理(質素及標準)

Dr PANG Fei-chau

Deputizing Chief Manager (Quality & Standards), Hospital Authority

譚廣亨教授

香港大學副校長

Professor TAM Kwong-hang, Paul

Pro-Vice-Chancellor and Vice-President, The University of Hong Kong

曾昭義醫生

衞生署家庭醫學顧問醫生

Dr TSANG Chiu-yee, Luke

Consultant (Family Medicine), Department of Health

謝鴻興醫生

香港醫學會會長

Dr TSE Hung-hing

President, The Hong Kong Medical Association

楊重光教授

香港外科醫學院院長

Professor YEUNG Chung-kwong

President, The College of Surgeons of Hong Kong

#### 秘書

## Secretary

杜美琪醫生

食物及衞生局首席醫生(食物及衞生)特別職務

Dr TO May-kei, Liza

Principal Medical & Health Officer (Food & Health) Special Duties Food and Health Bureau

# **Reporting Criteria**

"Any child presenting with renal diseases including calculi and with history of exposure to melamine containing dairy products."

# **Case Definition**

Suspected case (懷疑病例)	<ul> <li>Individuals having consumed food that is tainted with melamine (according to the lists of unsatisfactory/tainted foods promulgated by CFS and/or AQSIQ and/or other official agencies overseas); AND either of the following conditions:</li> <li>Having a positive ultrasound finding of renal stone(s), sand or filtrated residues,* where other potential causes have been excluded by differential diagnosis; OR</li> <li>Having a verified, positive history of passing renal stone(s), sand or filtrated residues, where other potential causes have been excluded by differential diagnosis.</li> </ul>
Probable case (臨床病例)	A "suspected case" with melamine intake exceeding the tolerable daily intake threshold of 0.63 mg/kg for those over 36 months of age or 0.32 mg/kg body weight for those 36 months or younger **, for a significant duration.
Confirmed case (確診病例)	A "probable case" with laboratory confirmation. ***

- \* Exact radiologic criteria defining a positive ultrasound examination as per the HA Expert Group on MTMP related Disorders. If ultrasound was performed outside HK, a written report or ultrasound film should be available to confirm the finding.
- \*\* According to Centre for Food Safety.
- \*\*\* Subject to further assessment of technical feasibility and scientific validity.

# 呈報準則

「任何呈腎病(包括結石)症狀並曾食用含三聚氰胺奶類產品的兒童。」

# 個案定義

#### |懷疑病例

曾食用受三聚氰胺污染的食物(根據食物安全中心及/或國家質量監督檢查檢疫總局及/或其他海外官方機構公布的不符合要求/受污染食物名單所列食物),並且符合以下任何一種情況的人士:-

- 超音波檢查結果顯示腎臟出現結石、幼小沙 石或固體剩餘物\*的陽性結果,並經由鑑別 診斷排除了其他可能成因;或
- 經證實確曾有排出腎石、幼小沙石或固體剩餘物的病歷,並經由鑑別診斷排除了其他可能成因。

#### 臨床病例

"懷疑病例"人士所攝取三聚氰胺超過每日可容忍攝入量上限達一段相當的時間。年齡為 36 個月以上,其攝取量上限為每公斤體重 0.63 毫克,至於年齡為 36 個月或以下,其攝取量上限則為每公斤體重 0.32 毫克\*\*。

確診病例 經化驗證實的"臨床病例"。\*\*\*

- 超音波檢查陽性定義是根據醫管局的三聚氰胺專家小組 釐定。如病人的超音波檢查在香港以外的地方進行,則 須有書面報告或超音波底片以證實檢查結果。
- \*\* 根據食物安全中心的資料。
- \*\*\* 須就技術可行性及科學求證作進一步評估。